



BOARD OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION

Promoting the use and conservation of historic properties for the education, inspiration, pleasure and enrichment of the citizens of Sioux Falls

DRAFT Meeting Minutes for February 8, 2017

Members Present:

Thomas Keller, Chair
Shelly Sjovold, Vice-Chair
Josh Chilson
Rob Collins
Gary Conradi
Jennifer Dumke
Cindy Konda
Rachael Meyerink
Lura Roti
Robbie Veurink

Members Absent:

None

Public in Attendance:

John Stratman, Applicant
Nancy Stratman, Applicant
Grant Houwman, Applicant
Rich Jensen, Altus
James Jacobson, Citizen
Rick Gourley, Citizen
Adam Roach, City of Sioux Falls

Staff Present:

Diane deKoeper, Board Liaison, Urban Planner
Russ Sorenson, Urban Planner

Call to order –Chairperson Tom Keller called the meeting to order at 4:01 p.m., welcomed board members and guests, and gave introductory comments.

1. Approval of the January 11, 2017, Meeting Minutes

Chairperson, Tom Keller, requested a motion to approve the January 11, 2017 meeting minutes. Member Shelly Sjovold made the motion to approve the meeting minutes. Member Rob Collins seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

2. Public input on non-agenda items:

Chairperson, Tom Keller, requested if there was anyone from the public who desired to provide input to the Board on any non-agenda items. There was no citizen input received.

(over)

3. New Business:

- A. 1312 S. Phillips Ave. All Saints Historic District John Stratman
(Board action required)

Applicant, John Stratman, expressed his interest to purchase the residential property located at 1312 S. Phillips Avenue, within the All Saints Historic District. Mr. Stratman explained his application request to renovate the front/west façade and the rear/east façade, replace windows, tear down the existing dilapidated garage and replace with another garage structure. He referenced his application packet, including drawings depicting improvements, historical newspaper article, and several photographs. Mr. Stratman commented that he conducted a windshield survey of the All Saints Neighborhood and discovered that approximately 27 properties utilize column and railing construction vs. knee wall construction on the porch of house structures.

The applicant's list of proposed improvements to the property at 1312 S. Phillips Avenue include:

Front/West Façade:

1. Change the siding on the second story and attic dormer of the front of the house to scallops rather than the less attractive clapboard siding that currently exists to enhance the overall appearance of the house.
2. Change the attic dormer window to a three pane divided window.
3. Remove the current silver aluminum storm windows with no replacement or replace with a color matching window.
4. Remove the lattice work skirting beneath the deck on the north side of the front porch and replace with the clapboard siding that is currently used on the front of the house to improve the appearance and be consistent with other materials used below the deck of the front porch.
5. Remove the knee wall currently surrounding the front porch and replace it with a railing and spindle configuration. The railing would be of sufficient height to meet current city codes. This change would enhance the overall appearance of the house and neighborhood.

Rear/East Façade:

1. Replace the open porch on the main level of the home with a combined bathroom and laundry. This would require extending to the east the foundation of the back porch by 4'. At the same time the foundation would be extended 4' to the south. The structure would also include a small deck approximately 5' wide with steps to the south. Windows on this addition would be of a 3 pane transom style. They would be on both the east and south sides of the proposed addition. The addition would carry the same clapboard siding as exists on all sides of the house.
2. Second story screen porch would remain intact with new screen material.
3. Remove the current single car garage and replace with a new 234' x 24' two stall garage that faces north. This structure would be one that does not mimic, but rather compliments the appearance of the house. House and garage would share the same exterior paint scheme.

4. The entire roof would have existing gutters removed and replaced with a larger gutter system that can handle the rain runoff from the large roof area and at the same time be more resistant to plugging from the abundance of tree leaves that surround the house. Exterior windows would be replaced with wood windows that include a 3x3 divided pane in the top half. The paint scheme would be multiple (2 or 3) colors that are consistent with the period.

Member Lura Roti expressed her appreciation to the applicant for appearing before the board before purchasing the house. She noted the house is in disrepair and proposed renovations to the house would be a historic district neighborhood improvement.

Member Shelly Sjovold inquired as to what kind of siding on the house is being proposed. The applicant referenced his plan drawings and responded that he proposes to change the siding on the second story and attic dormer of the front of the house to scallops rather than the less attractive clapboard siding that currently exists to enhance the overall appearance of the house. Member Shelly Sjovold referenced the 1918 Sioux Falls Labor Newspaper article and photographs submitted by the applicant and commented that scallop design materials were not part of the historic or original house design.

Member Rob Collins commented that although the scallop design is more modern and may perhaps look better, but that it is a deviation from the original historic house design.

Mr. Stratman responded there are several homes within the historic district that have scallop design siding.

Member Gary Conradi stated that based on the applicant's historic materials submitted, there is no history of scallop siding used on the house.

Mr. Stratman remarked the alternative, to not do any renovations would be a greater sin. He said that his list of proposed improvements is important to him, and that he leaves the decision up to the discretion of the Board. Mr. Stratman stated that he would be willing to accept shake shingle siding design instead of scallop siding design.

Mr. James Jacobson, property owner to the north - 1308 and 1310 S. Phillips Avenue - spoke in support of Mr. Stratman's renovation project. He indicated the house has been vacant and is in disrepair. The garage is close to falling down and presents a safety concern to the neighborhood. He mentioned that his structure has shake shingles on the building's second floor facade.

A Board member commented that changing the house style with scallop design siding would be more unique to the house than using shingle design siding. He urged to keep the historical appearance as much as possible.

Member Robbie Veurink pointed to the proposed craftsmanship details, such as the proposed spindles and tapered columns on the front porch. He inquired about the shape of the spindles. Mr. Stratman replied the spindles would be square in shape. The applicant also mentioned his intentions to replace the furnace and remove the existing roof chimney used for exhaust. City staff liaison, Diane deKoeper, responded there would be no concerns with removing the chimney.

(over)

Member Gary Conradi stated the applicant proposes structural repairs that are great enhancements.

Other board members commented that siding materials to be used should be clap board, and that the knee wall design be continued on the porch in front of the house.

No other public comments were received.

Member Lura Roti made a motion that the application as it is proposed and exists now, would have an adverse effect on the historic structure and district based upon the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation – specifically – Standards #2 and #5.

Standard #2 - The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided; and

Standard #5 – Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

However, the applicant's proposal for renovations to the rear of the house, and the garage demolition and new replacement are acceptable.

Board members requested clarification to the motion.

Chairperson Tom Keller attempted to clarify the motion. He stated that based upon the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation – specifically – Standards #2 and #5, - that the applicant's proposed work items #1, #4, and #5 for the front/west façade of the house (listed below) would have an adverse effect on the historic house and district, and the applicant's proposed work items #2, #3, and #4, for the rear/east façade (listed below) would not have an adverse effect.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

Standard #2 - The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided; and

Standard #5 – Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

Applicant's Proposed Work Items:

Front/west façade – work items would have an adverse effect on the historic house and district -

1. Change the siding on the second story and attic dormer of the front of the house to scallops rather than the less attractive clapboard siding that currently exists to enhance the overall appearance of the house.
4. Remove the lattice work skirting beneath the deck on the north side of the front porch and replace with the clapboard siding that is currently used on the front of the house to improve the appearance and be consistent with other materials used below the deck of the front porch.
5. Remove the knee wall currently surrounding the front porch and replace it with a railing and spindle configuration. The railing would be of sufficient height to meet current city codes. This change would enhance the overall appearance of the house and neighborhood.

Rear/east façade - work items would not have an adverse effect on the historic house and district -

2. Second story screen porch would remain intact with new screen material.
3. Remove the current single car garage and replace with a new 234' x 24' two stall garage that faces north. This structure would be one that does not mimic, but rather compliments the appearance of the house. House and garage would share the same exterior paint scheme.
4. The entire roof would have current gutters removed and replaced with a larger gutter system that can handle the rain runoff from the large roof area and at the same time be more resistant to plugging from the abundance of trees that surround the house. Exterior windows would be replaced with wood windows that include a 3x3 divided pane in the top half. The paint scheme would be multiple (2 or 3) colors that are consistent with the period.

Member Lura Roti acknowledged her acceptance of the clarification by Chairperson Tom Keller.

Member Gary Conradi seconded the motion as clarified by Chairperson Tom Keller. The motion passed unanimously.

- B. Harms Motor Car Company, Downtown Historic District Rich Jensen, Altus
104 W. 12th St. – west facade
(*Board action required*)

At the Board's January 11, 2017 Meeting, members unanimously approved, the applicant's renovation project to include: removing the existing stucco in its entirety. Tuckpoint and replace brick as needed - mortar to be repaired as necessary, damaged brick to be replaced with brick having the same vintage, rake and color; new windows to include aluminum clad wood frame, entrance doors to be provided; and removal of existing exterior finish and prep for new stucco.

Applicant, Rich Jensen - Altus, and owner, Grant Houwman, explained that since the Board's January 11, 2017 meeting, their structural engineer has recommended necessary building modifications affecting the west and north building facades. Review by the Board is for the west and north facades only. For the west façade improvements include replacing the west building wall with concrete block and stucco, instead of using brick materials. On the north façade, improvements include infilling the window openings with block and stucco. It has also been recently discovered that the existing roof is a wood bow truss system which is very rare and unique construction. The owner wants to expose and preserve this distinctive truss system.

The applicant mentioned the project adds value to the neighborhood and city. Rehabilitation preserves a historic building that is in need of extensive repairs, and which would otherwise be at risk of demolition in the near future. Conversion to office space provides for a higher density usage, housing more workers than the previous garage use. Also, the value of the property will increase significantly, adding to city, county, and school revenue base.

(over)

No other public comments were received.

Member Rob Collins made a motion to allow rebuilding the west wall with block and stucco with arched windows and filling in the window openings on the north building façade.

Member Cindy Konda seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Russ Sorenson, staff liaison, left the meeting.

- C. Auburn Nash Façade Easement Adam Roach, CD
(*Board information only*)

Since the board had just reviewed and approved the above noted project, Adam Roach noted that the information for the façade easement review was the same. Chairperson Keller acknowledged the previous discussion and that since this item was for information only by the board, it was approved.

No public comments were received.

- D. Graham Salvage Façade Easement Adam Roach, CD
(*Board information only*)

Adam Roach referenced the information packet and presented the building renovations that have occurred for the former Illinois Central Roundhouse located at 525 N Weber Avenue. The building has been remodeled and converted into an architectural office building for Perspective Architects. Board members discussed the building improvements and the contribution to the downtown.

Member Shelly Sjovold made a motion to approve the project. Member Jennifer Dumke seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

No public comments were received.

Member Robbie Veurink left the meeting at 5:15.

- E. 816 E. 8th St. Façade Easement Adam Roach, CD
(*Board information only*)

The applicant, Rick Gourley, explained the building located at 816 E. 8th Street is within the Whittier Neighborhood and will be renovated for use by commercial tenants. Exterior building improvements include replacement of existing windows with low energy efficient clear windows with a thermal break.

The brick exterior surface will be tuckpointed and a masonry seal applied. The existing overhang on the south building façade will be resurfaced with a metal fascia product.

(over)

Member Rachael Meyerink made a motion to approve the project. Member Rob Collins seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

No public comments were received.

Member Lura Roti left the meeting at 5:20.

4. Other Business:

- A. Goals for the Board in 2017 Diane
(Board information only)

Member Shelly Sjovold asked if the State might allow us to expand the Courthouse & Warehouse Historic District to include the East Bank. Board Liaison, Diane deKoeper reported that she had spoken with Liz Almilie with SHPO who said that since many of the buildings in the East Bank are individually listed that incorporating them into the district wouldn't be prudent. Member Sjovold expressed the interest for the expansion would include 8th St. up to Cliff Ave. Diane responded that a letter on behalf of the board could be written with supporting material to request the expansion and that it could be included in the 2017-18 budget if funding would be required for reconnaissance work.

- B. Administrative and Board Review Diane
(Board information only)

Board Liaison, Diane deKoeper, presented the Board with an informational document, dated February 2017, which outlines Historic Preservation Reviews for Planning Staff and the BOHP. Due to the length of the meeting, Diane noted that we could discuss this information further at a following meeting.

- C. Cindy Konda's resignation from the board.
Cindy expressed her thanks to the board and how much she's enjoyed participating.
On behalf of the City of Sioux Falls, we thank Cindy for her contributions to the Board of Historic Preservation.

Adjournment - A motion to adjourn the Board of Historic Preservation meeting was made by board member Rob Collins and seconded by board member Rachael Meyerink. The motion passed unanimously. The meeting adjourned at approximately 5:30 p.m.

The next meeting of the Board of Historic Preservation will be on March 8, 2017, at 4:00 pm, in the Commission Room on first floor of City Hall.